

**ELECTRICITY ACT 1989 (SECTION 36 AND SCHEDULE 8)
TOWN AND COUNTRY PLANNING ACT 1990 (SECTION 90)
THE ELECTRICITY GENERATION STATIONS AND OVERHEAD LINES
(INQUIRIES PROCEDURE)(ENGLAND AND WALES) RULES 2007**

**PUBLIC INQUIRY TO CONSIDER SECTION 36 ELECTRICITY ACT 1989
APPLICATIONS BY:**

- (1) STEADINGS WINDFARM LIMITED FOR CONSENT AND DEEMED
PLANNING PERMISSION TO CONSTRUCT AND OPERATE A
WINDFARM AT KIRKWHELPINGTON, NORTHUMBERLAND
(KNOWN AS STEADINGS)**
- (2) AMEC PROJECT INVESTMENTS LIMITED FOR CONSENT AND
DEEMED PLANNING PERMISSION TO CONSTRUCT AND
OPERATE A WINDFARM AT RAY ESTATE, NORTHUMBERLAND
(KNOWN AS RAY WINDFARM)**
- (3) WIND PROSPECTS DEVELOPMENT LIMITED FOR CONSENT
AND DEEMED PLANNING PERMISSION TO CONSTRUCT AND
OPERATE A WINDFARM AT GREEN RIGG FELL, BIRTLEY,
NORTHUMBERLAND (KNOWN AS GREEN RIGG WINDFARM)**

**MARK SPENCER
SUPPLEMENTARY PROOF OF EVIDENCE
IN SUPPORT OF OBJECTION BY
MINISTRY OF DEFENCE**

Treasury Solicitor
Commercial & Property Litigation Team 3D
Treasury Solicitor's Department
One Kemble Street
London
WC2B 4TS

DX 123242 Kingsway
Tel: 020 - 7210 4566
Fax: 020 - 7210 2996
Ref: Colin Andress

1. This supplementary proof of evidence addresses how I came to discover certain material relevant to this Inquiry. In doing so, I have sought to answer queries raised by the developers during the course of the Inquiry.

Threat Radar Material

2. From 1990 to 2000, John Powell was head of the SNS2 unit at RAF Henlow, which was responsible for the management and direction of specialist personnel engaged in the development of radar performance prediction methods, flight checking methods and equipment, electrical safety, Electro Magnetic Compatibility (EMC), Non-ionising Radiation Hazards (RADHAZ) and High Intensity Radiation Transmission Areas (HIRTA) studies for Aircraft. In 2000, the SNS2 unit was disbanded, and John Powell became substitute head of the entire *Surveillance and Navigation Systems* (SNS) Branch, covering SNS1 (air traffic and air defence radar systems); SNS3 (airfield navigation systems); SNS4 (radar installation) and SNS5 (UHF and VHF Radio Communication systems).

3. In 2001, Wing Commander Roy Hesketh took over as head of branch. A few months later, John Powell became head of my unit, SNS1. He brought with him documentation relating to the work carried out by SNS2. This was never integrated into the work performed or documentation produced by SNS1, but was kept in a separate filing cabinet. As far as I am aware, no-one in SNS1 knew that SNS2 documentation was retained at the unit.

4. John Powell retired in April 2007, and Robert Lorimer took over as head of SNS1. Although he inherited John Powell's filing system, including the filing cabinet with the SNS2 material, no-one had ownership of his files after he left.

5. On 17 March 2008, Sgt William Edmond, of RAF Spadeadam, located an MoD report dated 3 June 1998 entitled "Engineering Study to Assess the Effects of Wind Farms on EW Equipment." ("**1998 Report**"). The 1998 Report was provided to the Inquiry on 18 March 2008 [MOD/0/11]. That was the first occasion I had seen or heard of the 1998 Report. I could see from the introduction to the 1998 Report that it was a piece of work that had been carried out by SNS2 during the time that John Powell was head of that unit.

6. Accordingly, on the morning of Wednesday, 19 March 2008, at RAF Henlow I went through all of the files in a locked 3 drawer filing cabinet belonging to my former line manager, John Powell, looking in particular for anything with the same reference number as appears on the 1998 Report. I came across an RAF Signals

Engineering Establishment file entitled “EEI 11351 Effects of Wind Farms on EW Equipment,” opened on 23/9/97. On examination of the file, it was apparent that the 1998 Report had been document 34 of that file, but had been extracted. At the front of the file (enclosure 38) was a facsimile copy of the 1998 Report, excluding its Annexes, which had been sent to the task sponsor at RAF High Wycombe on 22 May 1998. All the documents in this file have since been made available to the Inquiry as MOD/3/9.

7. At the same time, I also found a VHS video titled “Windfarm Radar Trial 1998”. When played, this video showed a series of short video clips which appeared to relate to the 1998 report. I contacted John Powell by telephone on Thursday, 20 March 2008 and he confirmed that the VHS cassette was part of the trial results. That has been put onto DVD and since been made available as MOD/3/10.

8. When I telephoned John Powell, I asked generally about his involvement with the trial. He said that, although he had been head of section when the 1998 trial was conducted, he had not personally been involved but stated he believed that David Ball was the only branch member to work on the trials and that David had left the branch soon after the trials were complete. Unfortunately I have not been able to determine where David Ball is now. All John Powell could recall was that the trial had been conducted in two parts, one in various locations around RAF Spadeadam and one at RNAS Culdrose. The 1998 Report pertains to the trial at RNAS Culdrose whilst enclosure 7 of the EEI 11351 Effects of Wind Farms on EW Equipment file shows the results of the trials around RAF Spadeadam

Blinkbonny Height Inquiry Material

9. During the telephone conversation referred to above, John Powell mentioned that in the mid-1990s he had been asked to be a technical expert at a public inquiry into a proposed windfarm at Blinkbonny Height. That inquiry took place in 1996. As a result of this information, I went back to the filing cabinet and searched for any material from around 1996 bearing the name “Blinkbonny Height”. I discovered the file titled “Blinkbonny Heights Windfarm – Public Enquiry” opened on 07 October 1996, reference number RAFSEE/2191/6/2/GR. The documents in the file that are not covered by legal professional privilege have been made available to this Inquiry as MOD/3/11.

M SPENCER
ADATS-IPT-TB3B